

in the PBO + MXC hosts, the counts were comparable to those in PBO- and MXC-only mice. Similarly, in PARA + PBO mice, all sets of counts were comparable to those in PARA and PBO mice. These latter sets of results indicated that the toxicities of these two chemical combinations, at least in regard to impacts on T-cell populations *in situ*, were similar to those of any of their single chemical constituents. It is interesting to note that, with the MXC + PARA regimen, the changes in cell counts corresponded with the observed changes in SRBC-specific IgM responses. On the other hand, in the PBO + MXC group, although SRBC-specific IgM responses were decreased compared to the control, PBO, and MXC mice, there were no similar correspondence with the T-cell measures. This might suggest that the combined action of the PBO and MXC may have been directed more against the B-cell aspects of humoral responses than against T-cells; however, this still remains to be verified in more detailed studies.

In an immune response, local activated B-cells act as antigen-presenting cells for helper or cytotoxic T-cells (Goutet et al., 2005), proliferate, and differentiate into plasma cells to secrete antigen-specific antibodies. Some B-cells are activated at the T/B-cell border and migrate to form germinal centers (in primary follicles; Janeway et al., 2004); therefore, changes in the numbers of germinal centers and associated B-cells can reflect major responses to exposure to antigens or toxicants (Vieira & Rajewsky, 1990; Takahashi et al., 1998). A marked decrease in total B-cell counts was seen in the MXC + PARA-treated mice compared with that in MXC and PARA mice. Neither other combinational treatment had a similar significant effect. At the germinal center level, both MXC + PARA and PBO + MXC led to significant reductions in B-cell levels; PARA + PBO had no significant impact. Compared to their individual agents, MXC + PARA treatment caused even greater reductions in total B-cell levels, but had no effect at the germinal center level. This contrasts with PBO + MXC that had the opposite effect, i.e. no impact at total B-cell level but significantly so at germinal centers. While these opposing outcomes are without explanation at this point, the upshot is that the combinational treatments with PBO + MXC or MXC + PARA are toxic to B-cells *in situ*. Toxicity from PARA + PBO is nominal at best.

The findings with the PBO + MXC mice supports our contention cited in the early paragraphs about potentially more selective effects on B-cells. That the MXC + PARA regimen also impacted on B-cells (beyond above-noted effects on thymic weights, T-cell counts, and IgM responses) suggested that this specific combination displayed a far more immunotoxic targeting than the other combined regimen. Whether such a divergent effect is due to differences in synergizing effects from each individual agent is an interesting possibility. Future studies with gradational combinations of each test chemical should allow us to ascertain which of the individual agents is driving any synergisms.

Conclusions

Our data show that combined exposure to certain environmental chemicals can induce immunotoxicity, as shown by effects on SRBC-specific IgM responses and T- or B-cell counts, compared to that by individual exposure to the chemicals in mixtures. However, this toxicity appears to differ, depending on which chemicals are combined. In particular, it was clear that, among the three combinations, MXC + PARA presented the most immunotoxic profile in the murine hosts. The combined toxicity may be affected by chemical structure, receptor binding, and immune pathways involved; further studies are currently in progress. It is expected that the results of this study will help others in their evaluation of immunotoxic combinational effects

when conducting assessments of the safety of environmental/occupational chemicals.

Acknowledgements

This work was supported by a research Grant-in-Aid from the Ministry of Health, Labor, and Welfare of Japan. The authors wish to thank Mrs Y. Tajima and L. Miyashita of the Institute of Environmental Toxicology (Ibaraki, Japan) for their technical assistance.

Declaration of interest

The authors report no conflicts of interest. The authors alone are responsible for the content and writing of the paper.

References

- Battaglia, C. L., Gogal Jr., R. M., Zimmerman, K., and Misra, H. P. 2010. Malathion, lindane, and piperonyl butoxide, individually or in combined mixtures, induce immune-toxicity via apoptosis in murine splenocytes *in vitro*. *Int. J. Toxicol.* 29:209–220.
- Casale, G. P., Cohen, S. D., and DiCapua, R. A. 1984. Parathion-induced suppression of humoral immunity in inbred mice. *Toxicol. Lett.* 23: 239–247.
- Committee on Proprietary Medicinal Products. 2000. *Note for Guidance on Repeat-Dose Toxicity*, CPMP/SWP/1042/99. Available online at: <http://www.emea.eu.int>.
- Cunningham, A. J. 1965. A method of increased sensitivity for detecting single antibody-forming cells. *Nature* 207:1106–1107.
- Diel, F., Horr, B., Borck, H., et al. 1999. Pyrethroids and piperonyl-butoxide affect human T-lymphocytes *in vitro*. *Toxicol. Lett.* 107: 65–74.
- EPA (United States Environmental Protection Agency). 1998. *Health Effects Test Guidelines: Immunotoxicity*. 1998, OPPTS 870.7800. Available online at: <http://www.epa.gov/opptsfrs/publications>
- FDA (United States Food and Drug Administration). 2002. *Guidance for Industry: Immunotoxicology Evaluation of Investigational New Drugs*. Available online at: <http://www.fda.gov/cder/guidance>
- Feron, V. J., Groten, J. P., Jonker, D., et al. 1995. Toxicology of chemical mixtures: Challenges for today and the future. *Toxicology* 105: 415–427.
- Flipo, D., Bernier, J., Girard, D., et al. 1992. Combined effects of selected insecticides on humoral immune response in mice. *Int. J. Immunopharmacol.* 14:747–752.
- Fukuyama, T., Kosaka, T., Hayashi, K., et al. 2013. Immunotoxicity in mice induced by short-term exposure to methoxychlor, parathion, or piperonyl butoxide. *J. Immunotoxicol.* 10:150–159.
- Fukuyama, T., Tajima, Y., Ueda, H., and Kosaka, T. 2011. Prior exposure to immunosuppressive organophosphorus or organochlorine compounds aggravates the T(H)1- and T(H)2-type allergy caused by topical sensitization to 2,4-dinitrochlorobenzene and trimellitic anhydride. *J. Immunotoxicol.* 8:170–182.
- Fukuyama, T., Tajima, Y., Ueda, H., et al. 2010. Apoptosis in immunocytes induced by several types of pesticides. *J. Immunotoxicol.* 7:39–56.
- Gilbert, K. M., Rowley, B., Gomez-Acevedo, H., and Blossom, S. J. 2011. Co-exposure to mercury increases immunotoxicity of trichloroethylene. *Toxicol. Sci.* 119:281–292.
- Goutet, M., Pepin, E., Langonne, I., et al. 2005. Identification of contact and respiratory sensitizers using flow cytometry. *Toxicol. Appl. Pharmacol.* 205:259–270.
- Groten, J. P., Feron, V. J., and Suhnel, J. 2001. Toxicology of simple and complex mixtures. *Trends Pharmacol. Sci.* 22:316–322.
- Groten, J. P., Schoen, E. D., van Bladeren, P. J., et al. 1997. Subacute toxicity of a mixture of nine chemicals in rats: Detecting interactive effects with a fractionated two-level factorial design. *Fundam. Appl. Toxicol.* 36:15–29.
- Hernandez, A. F., Parron, T., Tsatsakis, A. M., et al. 2013. Toxic effects of pesticide mixtures at a molecular level: Their relevance to human health. *Toxicology* 307:136–145.
- Herzyk, D. J., and Holsapple, M. 2007. Immunotoxicity evaluation by immune function tests: Focus on the T-dependent antibody response (TDAR). Overview of Workshop Session at 45th Annual Meeting of Society of Toxicology March 5-9, 2006 San Diego, CA. *J. Immunotoxicol.* 4:143–147.

- Holsapple, M. P. 2003. Developmental immunotoxicity testing: A review. *Toxicology* 185:193–203.
- ICH. 2006. International Conference on harmonization of technical requirements for registration of pharmaceuticals for human use. *ICH Harmonized Tripartite Guideline Immunotoxicity Studies For Human Pharmaceuticals S8*. Switzerland: ICH.
- Instititoris, L., Papp, A., Siroki, O., et al. 2002. Immuno- and neurotoxicological investigation of combined subacute exposure with the carbamate pesticide propoxur and cadmium in rats. *Toxicology* 178:161–173.
- Instititoris, L., Siroki, O., Undeger, U., et al. 1999. Immunotoxicological effects of repeated combined exposure by cypermethrin and the heavy metals lead and cadmium in rats. *Int. J. Immunopharmacol.* 21:735–743.
- Janeway, C. A., Travers, P., Walport, M., and Shlomchik, M. J., (Eds.). 2004. *Immunobiology*, 6th Edition. New York: Grand Science.
- Jerne, N. K., and Nordin, A. A. 1963. Plaque formation in agar by single antibody-producing cells. *Science* 140:405.
- Kortenkamp, A., Faust, M., Scholze, M., and Backhaus, T. 2007. Low-level exposure to multiple chemicals: Reason for human health concerns? *Environ. Health. Perspect.* 115:106–114.
- Lowry, O. H., Rosebrough, N. J., Farr, A. L., and Randall, R. J. 1951. Protein measurement with the Folin phenol reagent. *J. Biol. Chem.* 193:265–275.
- Luster, M. I., Munson, A. E., Thomas, P. T., et al. 1988. Development of a testing battery to assess chemical-induced immunotoxicity: National Toxicology Program's guidelines for immunotoxicity evaluation in mice. *Fundam. Appl. Toxicol.* 10:2–19.
- Mitsumori, K., Takegawa, K., Shimo, T., et al. 1996. Morphometric and immunohistochemical studies on atrophic changes in lymphohematopoietic organs of rats treated with piperonyl butoxide or subjected to dietary restriction. *Arch. Toxicol.* 70:809–814.
- Nishino, R., Fukuyama, T., Tajima, Y., et al. 2013. Prior oral exposure to environmental immunosuppressive chemicals methoxychlor, parathion, or piperonyl butoxide aggravates allergic airway inflammation in NC/Nga mice. *Toxicology* 309C:1–8.
- Simmons, J. E. 1995. Chemical mixtures: Challenge for toxicology and risk assessment. *Toxicology* 105:111–119.
- Smialowicz, R. J., DeVito, M. J., Riddle, M. M., et al. 1997. Opposite effects of 2,2',4,4',5,5'-hexachlorobiphenyl and 2,3,7,8-tetrachlorodibenzo-*p*-dioxin on the antibody response to sheep erythrocytes in mice. *Fundam. Appl. Toxicol.* 37:141–149.
- Takahashi, Y., Dutta, P. R., Cerasoli, D. M., and Kelsoe, G. 1998. *In situ* studies of the primary immune response to (4-hydroxy-3-nitrophenyl)-acetyl. V. Affinity maturation develops in two stages of clonal selection. *J. Exp. Med.* 187:885–895.
- Takeuchi, Y., Kosaka, T., Hayashi, K., et al. 2002b. Alterations in the developing immune system of the rat after perinatal exposure to methoxychlor. *J. Toxicol. Pathol.* 17:165–170.
- Takeuchi, Y., Kosaka, T., Hayashi, K., et al. 2002a. Thymic atrophy induced by methoxychlor in rat pups. *Toxicol. Lett.* 135:199–207.
- Temple, L., Kawabata, T. T., Munson, A. E., and White Jr., K. L. 1993. Comparison of ELISA and plaque-forming cell assays for measuring the humoral immune response to SRBC in rats and mice treated with benzo[a]pyrene or cyclophosphamide. *Fundam. Appl. Toxicol.* 21:412–419.
- Teuschler, L., Klaunig, J., Carney, E., et al. 2002. Support of science-based decisions concerning the evaluation of the toxicology of mixtures: A new beginning. *Regul. Toxicol. Pharmacol.* 36:34–39.
- Vieira, P., and Rajewsky, K. 1990. Persistence of memory B-cells in mice deprived of T-cell help. *Int. Immunol.* 2:487–494.
- White, K. L., Musgrove, D. L., and Brown, R. D. 2010. The sheep erythrocyte T-dependent antibody response (TDAR). *Meth. Mol. Biol.* 598:173–184.

